## Evolution of Biofuels



Chris Somerville
Carnegie Institution, Stanford University, LBNL.
EBI

## Current and predicted energy use Current use 13 TW

Global Primary Energy Supply by Fuel*:



*- excludes traditional biomass
Source: IEA 2004, Jim Breson BP

## Potential of carbon-free energy sources



From: Basic Research Needs for Solar Energy Utilization, DOE 2005

## Combustion of biomass provides carbon neutral energy



## 90,000 TW of energy arrives on the earths surface from the sun



Amount of land needed for 13 TW at $1 \%$ efficiency $5 \%$ of land
650 MHa

## Land Usage



## Types of biofuels

- Solid, burned directly
- Diesel
- Sugar to ethanol
- Cellulose to ethanol


## Overview of Brazil sugarcane

- 2007-08 harvest 528 MMT
- ~8 M Ha planted by 2008
- ~20 B liters ethanol, 2007
- ~80-120 T/Ha
- ~6400 L ethanol/Ha
- ~333 mills, 100 planned
- Plantings last 5 y , cut one per year
- Large mill

- 22,000 tons/day
- 1500 truck loads/day


## Biofuel yields of various feedstocks



Worldwatch 2006

## US Biofuel Production has Expanded Rapidly



## US Biomass inventory = 1.3 billion tons



From: Billion ton Vision, DOE \& USDA 2005

## Effect of $50 \%$ stover removal on corn grain yields in eastern NE. (120kg N/ha)


K. Vogel et al., unpublished

## Perennials have little or no erosion



From Oliveira et al in: Jones and Walsh (eds) Miscanthus for Energy and Fibre, 2001

Some plants accumulate oil

(B) Triacylglycerol


## Biodiesel has been expanding rapidly

Figure 2. World Biodiesel Production, 1991-2005


Worldwatch 2006 \& Louise Fresco

## Limited potential of biodiesel



65 biodiesel companies in operation, 50 in construction 2006

## Use of algae could enable saline cultivation

 Greenfuel bioreactor
http://news.com.com/Photos+Betting+big+on+biodiesel/2009-1043_3-5714336.html?t

## Cellulosic fuels are expected to become the dominant source of biofuels



Modified from Richard Bain, NREL

## How Much Ethanol Could the Municipal Solid Waste from a City With 1 Million People Produce?

The average person in the United States generates approximately 1.8 kilograms of municipal solid waste (MSW) every day. Of this, typically about 75 percent is predominantly cellulosic organic material, including waste paper, wood wastes, cardboard, and waste food scraps. Thus, a city with 1 million people produces around 1,800 tonnes of MSW in total, or about 1,300 tonnes per day of organic material. Using technology that could convert organic waste to ethanol, roughly 330 liters of ethanol could be produced per tonne of organic waste. Thus, organic waste from a city with 1 million people would be enough feedstock to produce about 150 million liters per year. This is enough fuel to meet the needs of more than 58,000 people in the United States; 360,000 people in France; or nearly 2.6 million people in China at current rates of per capita fuel use.

Worldwatch, 2006

## >2\% yield is feasible

Yield of 26.5 tons/acre observed by Young \& colleagues in Illinois, without irrigation


## Perennials have more photosynthesis



Courtesy of Steve Long, University of Illinois

## Locations of European Miscanthus Trials



Figure 4.6. Geographical distribution of the trials in the European Miscanthus Productivity Network. See Preface for key to acronyms

From: Clifton-Brown et al in: Jones and Walsh (eds) Miscanthus for Energy and Fibre, 2001


## Yield comparison of two energy crops



Heaton and Long, submitted

## Potential bioenergy crops tested in the US

| English name | Latin name | Photo- synthetic pathway | Yields reported <br> $\left[\mathrm{DM} \mathrm{ha}{ }^{-1} \mathrm{a}^{-1}\right]^{\mathrm{a}}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Crested wheatgrass | Agropyron desertorum <br> (Fisch ex Link) Schult. | $\mathrm{C}_{3}$ | 16.3 |
| Redtop | Agrostis gigantea Roth | $\mathrm{C}_{3}$ | Not available |
| Big bluestem | Andropogon gerardii Vitman | $\mathrm{C}_{4}$ | 6.8-11.9 |
| Smooth bromegrass | Bromus inermis Leyss. | $\mathrm{C}_{3}$ | 3.3-6.7 |
| Bermudagrass | Cynodon dactylon L. | $\mathrm{C}_{4}$ | 1.0-1.9 |
| Intermediate wheatgrass | Elytrigia intermedia [Host] Nevski | $\mathrm{C}_{3}$ | Not available |
| Tall wheatgrass | Elytrigia pontica [Podp.] Holub | $\mathrm{C}_{3}$ | Not available |
| Weeping lovegrass | Eragrostis curvula (Schrad.) Nees | $\mathrm{C}_{4}$ | 6.8-13.7 |
| Tall Fescue | Festuca arundinacea Schreb. | $\mathrm{C}_{3}$ | 3.6-11.0 |
| Switchgrass | Panicum virgatum L. | $\mathrm{C}_{4}$ | 0.9-34.6 |
| Western wheatgrass | Pascopyrum smithii (Rydb.) A. Love | $\mathrm{C}_{3}$ | Not available |
| Bahiagrass | Paspalum notatum Flugge | $\mathrm{C}_{4}$ | Not available |
| Napiergrass (elephant grass) | Pennisetum purpureum Schum | $\mathrm{C}_{4}$ | 22.0-31.0 |
| Reed canary grass | Phalaris arundinacea L. | $\mathrm{C}_{3}$ | 1.6-12.2 |
| Timothy | Phleum pratense L. | $\mathrm{C}_{3}$ | 1.6-6.0 |
| Energy cane | Saccharum spp. | $\mathrm{C}_{4}$ | 32.5 |
| Johnsongrass | Sorghum halepense (L.) Pers. | $\mathrm{C}_{4}$ | 14.0-17.0 |
| Eastern gammagrass | Tripsacum dactyloides (L.) L. | $\mathrm{C}_{4}$ | $3.1-8.0$ |

[^0]From Lewandowski et al., Biomass \& Bioenergy 25,335

## Theoretical yield of cellulosic ethanol from various feedstocks

| Feedstock | Theoretical Yield in gallons per dry ton of feedstock |  |
| :--- | :--- | :---: |
| Corn Grain |  | 124.4 |
| Corn Stover |  | 113.0 |
| Rice Straw |  | 109.9 |
| Cotton Gin Trash |  | 56.8 |
| Forest Thinnings |  | 81.5 |
| Hardwood Sawdust |  | 100.8 |
| Bagasse |  | 111.5 |
| Mixed Paper |  | 116.2 |

Wes Herman, GCEP

## High yield decreases transportation and land costs




Richard Hamilton, Ceres

## Soil carbon increases in perennial crops with all aboveground biomass removed



Tilman, Hill \& Lehman Science 314,1598

## Perennials have little or no erosion



From Oliveira et al in: Jones and Walsh (eds) Miscanthus for Energy and Fibre, 2001

## Harvesting Miscanthus


http://bioenergy.ornl.gov/gallery/index.html

## Ecological niches in Miscanthus vs corn in Germany



From Oliveira et al in: Jones and Walsh (eds) Miscanthus for Energy and Fibre, 2001 More extensive analysis in Semere \& Slater (2007) Biomass \& Energy 31,30

## Annual precipitation

## Annual Average Precipitation

United States of America


Period: 1961-1990

## Geographic distribution of biomass



Wright et al DOE-ORNL-EERE

## Limiting factors for global NPP



Baldocchi et al. 2004 SCOPE 62

## Economics of Perennials are Favorable

| CROP | Yield <br> per Acre | Value <br> $\$$ | Cost <br> $\$$ | Profit <br> $\$$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Corn (\$4.2/bu) <br> $(\$ 150 / t)$ | 160 bu | 672 | $193^{*}$ | 479 |
| Switchgrass <br> $(\$ 50 / t)$ | 10 tons | 500 | $138 * *$ | 362 |
| Miscanthus <br> $(\$ 50 / t)$ | 15 tons | 750 | $138^{* *}$ | 612 |
| *USDA economic research service 2004 <br> **50\% as much fertilizer, no chemicals |  |  |  |  |



From: Breaking the Biological Barriers to Cellulosic Ethanol

## The challenge is efficient conversion

- Burning switchgrass (10 t/ha) yields 14.6-fold more energy than input to produce*
- But, converting switchgrass to ethanol calculated to consume $45 \%$ more energy than
 produced


## Pretreatment - Example

## Reactor Solids Cost Impact:

Prehydrolysis Solids Concentration Sensitivity


NREL Analysis

## Plants are mostly composed of sugars



## Lignin occludes polysaccharides




## Sheep prefer low lignin



Clint Chapple, Purdue


Current Opinion in Plant Biology
Humphreys and Chapple, Curr Opin Plant Biol 5,224

## A cleavable lignin precursor would fundamentally alter preprocessing


rosmarinic acid

## Enzymatic hydrolysis of cellulose is slow



Skopec, Himmel, Matthews, Brady Protein Engineering 16, 1005

## Possible routes to improved catalysts

- Explore the enzyme systems used by termites (and ruminants) for digesting lignocellulosic material
- Compost heaps and forest floors are poorly explored
- In vitro protein engineering of promising enzymes
- Develop synthetic organic
 catalysts (for polysaccharides and lianin)


## Dissolution of cellulose in an ionic liquid

(novel pretreatment methods may create fundamental changes)


Untreated

Treated

Swatloski, Spear, Holbrey, Rogers J. Am. Chem. Soc., 124 (18), 4974-4975, 2002

## Fermentation of all sugars is essential



Jeffries \& Shi Adv Bioch Eng 65,118

## Saccharification \& Fermentation

Fermentation Yield Cost Impact


NREL


From: Breaking the Biological Barriers to Cellulosic Ethanol

## Nature offers many alternatives to ethanol

- Plants, algae, and bacteria synthesize alkanes, alcohols, waxes
- Production of hydrophobic compounds would reduce toxicity and decrease the energy required for dehydration



## Microbial synthesis of artemisinin




Jay Keasling

## Conversion of sugar to alkanes






aldol crossed-
condensation





Huber et al., (2005) Science 308,1446

## The "hydrogen economy"



## The Sleipner Experiment

1 million tons/y; capacity 600 B tons
7000 such sites needed

www.agiweb.org/geotimes

## Summary of priorities

- Develop energy crops and associated agronomic practices
- Identify or create more active catalysts for conversion of biomass to sugars
- Develop industrial microorganisms that ferment all sugars
- Develop new types of microorganisms that produce and secrete hydrophobic compounds


## A vision of the Future


http://genomicsgtl.energy.gov/biofuels/index.shtml

## HISTORY OF US FEDERAL GOVERNMENT R \& D



## Federal Research Budge† 2006

Billions


## Global grain production with and without yield enhancements



Data from worldwatch

## Risks: Historical Price of Oil



## The 1.3 Billion Ton Biomass Scenario




[^0]:    ${ }^{a} \mathrm{t}=\mathrm{Mg}$.

